2010

Comparison of Organic and Conventional Crops at the Neely-Kinyon Long-term Agroecological Research (LTAR) Site

Kathleen Delate
Iowa State University, kdelate@iastate.edu

Vivian Bernau
Iowa State University

Jeff Butler
Iowa State University

Comparison of Organic and Conventional Crops at the Neely-Kinyon Long-term Agroecological Research (LTAR) Site

Abstract
The Neely-Kinyon LTAR site was established in 1998 to study the long-term effects of organic production in Iowa. Treatments at the LTAR site, replicated four times in a completely randomized design, include the following rotations: conventional CornSoybean (C-S), organic Corn-SoybeanOats/Alfalfa (C-S-O/A), organic CornSoybean-Oats/Alfalfa-Alfalfa (C-S-O/A-A), and Soybean-Wheat with a red clover frostseeding (S-W/RC). Arapahoe winter wheat was planted on November 19, 2008, at 85 lb/acre and Cardinal red clover was frostseeded into the wheat plots on March 12, 2009, at a rate of 15.5 lb/acre. On April 16, 2009, Spur oats were underseeded with BR Blue Jay alfalfa at a rate of 90 lb/acre and 16 lb/acre, respectively. Following harvest of the organic corn plots in 2008, winter rye was no-till drilled at a rate of 75 lb/acre on November 10, 2008.

Keywords
RFR A9105, Horticulture, Agronomy

Disciplines
Agricultural Science | Agriculture | Agronomy and Crop Sciences | Horticulture

Comparison of Organic and Conventional Crops at the Neely-Kinyon Long-term Agroecological Research (LTAR) Site

RFR-A9105

Kathleen Delate, associate professor
Vivian Bernau, undergraduate research assistant
Departments of Horticulture and Agronomy
Jeff Butler, ag specialist

Materials and Methods

The Neely-Kinyon LTAR site was established in 1998 to study the long-term effects of organic production in Iowa. Treatments at the LTAR site, replicated four times in a completely randomized design, include the following rotations: conventional Corn-Soybean (C-S), organic Corn-Soybean-Oats/Alfalfa (C-S-O/A), organic Corn-Soybean-Oats/Alfalfa-Alfalfa (C-S-O/A-A), and Soybean-Wheat with a red clover frost-seeding (S-W/RC). Arapahoe winter wheat was planted on November 19, 2008, at 85 lb/acre and Cardinal red clover was frost-seeded into the wheat plots on March 12, 2009, at a rate of 15.5 lb/acre. On April 16, 2009, Spur oats were underseeded with BR Blue Jay alfalfa at a rate of 90 lb/acre and 16 lb/acre, respectively. Following harvest of the organic corn plots in 2008, winter rye was no-till drilled at a rate of 75 lb/acre on November 10, 2008.

Conventional corn plots were injected with 28% UAN on April 21, 2009, at 145 lb N/acre. Hoop-barn swine compost was applied to organic corn plots at a rate of 12 tons/acre on April 20 and 4 tons/acre to oat plots on April 15. Corn and soybean variety selection and planting methods in 2009 were as follows: Blue River 66H54 corn was planted at a depth of 1.75 in. as untreated seed at a rate of 32,000 seeds/acre in the organic plots and as treated seed in conventional plots, on May 20, 2009. Blue River 34A7 soybeans were planted at a depth of 2 in. in organic and conventional plots at a rate of 200,000 seeds/acre on May 21, 2009.

Conventional corn plots were sprayed with a pre-emergence herbicide on May 28 with 0.33 oz/acre of Basis, 1 lb/acre of Atrazine, 2 qt/100 gallons of COC, and 2.5 lb/acre of AMS. Conventional soybeans received an application of 2 pt/acre of Pursuit on May 14.

Soil in corn plots was sampled on July 17, 2009, and analyzed for late-spring nitrate content by the Iowa State University Soil and Plant Analysis Laboratory, Ames, IA. Fall soil samples were taken on November 4 for soil quality analysis.

All organic soybean plots were rotary hoed on May 24 before emergence and on June 11. Soybeans in the organic C-S-O/A-A plots were also rotary hoed on May 29. All organic soybean plots were cultivated on June 17, June 23, June 30, and July 13. Organic soybean plots were "walked" (hand weeded) on July 16 and July 29.

Organic corn plots were rotary hoed on May 24, May 29, and June 11, and cultivated on June 17, June 23, and June 26. Corn stands were counted June 11–19 and again on July 14; soybean stands were counted June 11–16, and July 17–22. Weed counts were enumerated in corn plots June 11–19, and again on July 20, and in all soybean plots June 11–16, and again July 17–July 22, using square meter quadrats at three randomly

selected areas within a plot. Corn borer populations were monitored on July 5. Soybean plots were sampled for bean leaf beetles on August 12. Corn stalk nitrate samples were collected on October 6, and soybean cyst nematode sampling was completed on October 19. Corn stalk nitrate analysis was conducted at the Iowa State University Soil and Plant Analysis Laboratory, Ames, IA, and nematode analysis was conducted at the ISU Plant Disease Clinic (Ames, IA).

Alfalfa was baled on June 14, July 12, and August 11. Wheat plots were harvested on July 24 and baled on July 26, and oat plots were harvested on July 24 and baled on July 26. Soybean plots were harvested on October 28. Corn plots were harvested on November 5. Samples were collected from each corn and soybean plot for grain quality analysis, which was conducted at the ISU Grain Quality Laboratory, Ames, IA.

Results and Discussion

For the corn plots in 2009, plant populations were similar in the conventional C-S and organic C-S-O/A and C-S-O/A rotations at 28,445 plants/acre (Table 1). Weed populations were higher than average in organic corn plots throughout the season, particularly with greater broadleaf weeds in the three-year organic rotation (C-S-O/A) on the first sampling date (June 16), at 16 weeds/sq meter. However, there were no significant differences in broadleaf weeds between conventional C-S and organic C-S-O/A-A rotations, which averaged 5 weeds/sq meter (Table 2). Grass weeds, however, were similar, averaging 6 weeds/sq meter, in all rotations on the first sampling date.

On the second sampling date, July 14, the C-S-O/A and the C-S-O/A-A plots had the lowest grass weed numbers, averaging 2 weeds/sq meter, but grass weeds in the C-S and C-S-O/A rotations were similar. Broadleaf weed populations averaged 3 weeds/sq meter across all rotations (Table 2).

Late-spring nitrate levels averaged 2.4 ppm NO_3-N across conventional and organic plots, which is considered low compared with previous years (Table 1). Corn stalk nitrate levels at the end of the season were also less than the recommended 2,000 ppm nitrate–N and were equivalent across all rotations, averaging 763 ppm nitrate–N (Table 1).

Soybean plant stands, at 135,833 plants/acre, were significantly greater in the conventional C-S plots in 2009, compared to the three- and four-year organic rotations, which averaged 84,542 plants/acre (Table 1). Soybean plant populations were significantly lower in the S-W/RC rotation compared with all other rotations (Table 1). Grass weed populations were high among organic rotations at the first sampling date, averaging 31 weeds/sq meter (Table 2). Broadleaf weed populations followed the same pattern as grass weeds, averaging 23 weeds/sq meter in organic plots compared to 1 weed/sq meter where herbicides were used in conventional plots (Table 2). On the second sampling date, populations of grass weeds remained high in organic plots, averaging 10 weeds/sq meter, but broadleaf weeds were reduced to an average of 3 weeds/sq meter, equivalent to conventional soybean plots.

Despite high levels of weeds and challenging weather, organic corn yields averaged 196 bushels/acre in 2009 (Table 1). The C-S-O/A-A rotation once again produced greater yields (198 bu/acre) than the three-year organic rotation was (194 bu/acre), and was equivalent to the conventional C-S rotation. Organic soybean yields averaged 60 bushels/acre (Table 1), with the S-W/RC plots yielding lower at 48 bushels/acre than

the three- (65 bu/acre) and four-year rotation (65 bu/acre). The conventional C-S soybean yields at 58 bushels/acre were less than soybean yields in the organic C-S-O/A and C-S-O/A-A plots, but equivalent to the organic S-W/RC plots. Small grain yields were impacted by extended periods of wet weather in 2009. Oats yielded 73 bushels/acre of grain and 1.14 tons/acre of oat straw, with no significant yield differences between oat rotations. Wheat yields were extremely impacted by a poor stand, lack of snow cover, and a wet spring, averaging only 9 bushels/acre and 1.34 tons/acre straw (Table 1). Alfalfa yielded an average of 3.9 tons/acre.

There was no damage from corn borer populations observed in 2009 (Table 2). Bean leaf beetle numbers were low in 2009, and stained soybeans averaged <1% stained soybeans in the C-S, C-S-O/A and C-S-O/A-A plots, but in S-W/RC plots, staining averaged 3.3%, which is considered a low level (Table 2). Soybean cyst nematodes were low overall, and despite levels reaching 38 eggs/100 cc of soil in the conventional soybean plots, there were no significant differences compared with organic plots where no eggs were recovered (Table 4).

Corn carbohydrate levels were equivalent among all rotations at 61.3% (Table 3). No significant difference was observed in corn grain oil content, averaging 4.1% across all rotations. Equivalent protein levels (8.4%) were found across all rotations (Table 3). Soybean carbohydrate levels (24%) and oil levels (18.6%) were similar across all rotations (Table 3). Protein levels were also equivalent among rotations at 34.6% (Table 3).

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the Leopold Center for Sustainable Agriculture for their support of the Neely-Kinyon LTAR site. We also thank the Wallace Foundation for their input and support. Thanks also go to Xiang Gao, Hang Qian, Meaghan Bryon, Bob Turnbull, Dan Cwach, Michael Graham; Charles Hurburgh and Glen Rippke of the ISU Grain Quality Lab; Kerry Culp of the ISU Soil and Plant Analysis Lab; and Maury Johnson of Blue River Hybrids and Albert Lea Seed House for providing seed for this study.