

Representing Gender Roles and Harmony in Friendship: A Moral Lesson for First Grade Vietnamese Students

Quynh Dang, *Indiana University Bloomington*

Abstract

Moral education which plays a crucial role in Vietnam is prevalently influenced by the Confucius concept of social harmony. This paper explores how gender representation in a first-grade moral lesson on friendship echoes both the discourse of harmony and the expectations of gender roles. This research uses the social actor relationships framework to analyze the manifestations of gender binaries and different expectations of gender roles boys and girls in visual images. The analysis confirms the prevalent bias in depicting males with more agency and power than females and gender stereotypes about both feminine and masculine traits. The imbalance of power and agency between man and woman can be understood through the Confucian hierarchical principles, which are also the cornerstones of social harmony. The generic depiction of both genders suggests the expectation for compliance and rigidity in playing gender roles to main a harmonious life.

Recommended Citation

Dang, Q. (2021). Representing gender roles and harmony in friendship: A moral lesson for first grade Vietnamese students. *Journal of Critical Thought and Praxis* 10(2), Article 3.
<https://doi.org/10.31274/jctp.11568>

Copyright and Open Access

© 2021 Quynh Dang



This article is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial \(CC BY-NC\) 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits any sharing and adaptation of the article, as long as the original author(s) and source are credited and the article is used for non-commercial purposes.

The *Journal of Critical Thought and Praxis* is published by the Iowa State University Digital Press (<https://press.lib.iastate.edu>) and the Iowa State University School of Education (<https://www.education.iastate.edu>)

In contemporary Vietnam, influences of Confucianism are still present in both public and private spheres. In Hanoi, the capital city of Vietnam, visitors will often be guided to visit the Temple of Literature dedicated to Confucius, sages, and scholars. It is also known as the first university of Vietnam. Vietnamese families continue embracing the Confucius ideal of harmony, maintaining hierarchical and harmonious relationships and roles among family members. At a very young age, children are taught about filial piety, respect for older people, and well-manner behaviors with others to maintain peaceful relationships (Burr, 2014). In other words, the legends and traditions of living a harmonious life persist.

With more than a thousand years under Chinese domination, Vietnam's educational system has inherited many ideologies from its former ruler, especially on schools and their purposes. It is a common Vietnamese belief that school is the ideal place for their children to learn and become moral people. As a result, schools in Vietnam are entitled to powerful functions from providing intellectual knowledge to shaping children's morality. In most Vietnamese public classrooms, the Confucian teaching philosophy "first learn the behavior, then the lesson" is often hung up on their walls as a daily reminder of the importance of behaving appropriately and living with a moral compass.

Moral Education at Schools

The idea of developing a strong sense of morality and a righteous way of being a citizen is infused in the school curriculum, most prominently in the morality subject. At the primary level, the moral education program emphasizes nurturing personalities, defining appropriate behaviors, and setting expectations for ethical values. At higher levels, the moral education curriculum takes on a bigger mission to maintain moral traditions and reinforce socialist citizenship (Duong & Phan, 2020). The curriculum at the secondary level and the high school level is oriented towards the socialist philosophy and principles that underscore the love for country, the citizens' responsibilities in fostering harmony and stability (Doan, 2005). Overall, moral education at Vietnamese schools is instrumental in delivering the state's expectations of which virtues children should embrace while reinforcing its controlling roles and orchestrating the right ways to be a citizen.

At this level, moral education is compulsory for all children who attend public schools. Thus, the examination of the elementary moral education program offers a lens to understand the moral expectations exposed to young children. The primary moral education curriculum encompasses multiple aspects, including character education, personality building, and citizenship education. Students are introduced to ethical and moral standards, which are considered age-appropriate and necessary for their personality building. The curriculum identifies five moral values that primary students should develop, including a love for the nation, compassion, hardworking, honesty, and responsibility (Ministry of Education and Training, 2017). The goal of being a moral person with all the mentioned virtues is to promote social harmony, which ensures the nation's stability and social orders.

The Concept of Harmony in the Elementary Moral Education Curriculum

Harmony is a prominent idea in Confucianism that captivates multiple levels of moral cultivation – at a personal level, in inter-personal interactions, in communal relationships, between an individual and the world, and between the person and the universe. At the first and most fundamental level, Confucian teachings emphasize harmony within oneself or the "person-

making" (*zou ren*) philosophy (Li, 2006, 2008). A person is responsible for cultivating their virtues to harmonize their inner mind and interactions with the outer world. Confucianism also believes that maintaining balance and consonance between one and another creates the ground for a stable order between the two, thus impacting broader communities such as the nation, the world, and the universe at large. In essence, harmony is a way of life (Li, 2006; Yao, 2000), a humanistic approach to engage with other beings and nature and to make judgments with considerations of the mutual influences of involved elements.

Harmony philosophy is manifested in the structure and the overarching goals of the moral education curriculum. Structurally, the primary school moral education is organized around five relational dimensions: the relationship with self; the personal pursuit; the relationship with others; the relationship with the community, nation, humankind; and the interaction with the environmental world (Ministry of Education and Training, 2017). These relational dimensions resonate with the Confucian concept of harmony, which occurs at various levels from within individuals, pursuits in life, interpersonal, communal, and intrapersonal (Li, 2006). Across the curriculum, harmony is articulated as a core principle for young people in operating their relationships – "between students and teachers, children and parents, friends versus friends, the younger and the older, the individual and the community, the citizen and the nation, and the human being with the world." (Ministry of Education and Training, 2017, p.118) In other words, the elementary moral education curriculum aspires to cultivate a sense of living in harmony for young children through the teaching of moral lessons.

Research Questions

Schools and the school curriculum are among the first official places for children to be exposed to social norms such as values and expectations for community members. Harmony, as a way of life, is among important social norms that children are expected to learn from school. Li (2013) and other authors (Tu, 1998; Yao, 2000) argued that the concept of harmony in Confucianism should be understood in all human and social relationships, such as in the family, at school, or at work. In Vietnam, harmony is manifested in many social aspects, such as family life and school management (Ha, 2008; Knodel et al., 2005; Schuler et al., 2006; Truong et al., 2017). For young children, besides the relationships with family, friendship and gender roles in friendship is also a significant component in shaping their views on social norms and traditions. Children learn about friendship and the power dynamics in friendships not just through interactions with their friends but also from school lessons such as the ones taught in moral education class. Therefore, it is significant to understand the messages about harmony and gender roles in a friendship that are delivered in the school curriculum.

However, the current body of research on Confucianism and harmony in education does not provide an understanding of how the concept of harmony is reflected in a particular relationship such as friendship or how friendship is represented in the curriculum through the lens of harmony. Research on Confucianism in education in Vietnam has posited that Confucianism in general and the ideal of harmony in particular is imbued and persists in the education system (Doan, 2005; Phan et al. 2011; Truong et al., 2017). Those researchers also point out that harmony can be understood from the representation of gender roles and how they are portrayed in school curriculum. To better understand how the concept of harmony and gender roles in friendship are represented in a curricular material and move beyond the familiar relationships in researching the Confucian ideal of harmony, this research focuses on the visual depiction of

friendship in a moral lesson from the moral education workbook for Vietnamese first graders (Luu et al., 2011). Three questions that guide this research include:

1. How often are males and females visually represented?
2. How differently are males and females visually represented?
3. How does visual gender representation reflect the discourse of harmony?

By examining the frequency of female and male depiction and specific ways that both genders are visualized, this research attempts to uncover the intersection between gender positioning and the discourse of harmony in friendship. Unlike textbooks in older grades where texts convey the lesson contents, the first-grade moral education workbook includes mostly images and minimal textual task instructions. The curriculum, in this case, is embedded in images that also have their language and carry certain discourses and ideologies (Fairclough, 2001; Van Leeuwen, 2008). In other words, instead of using texts to convey messages, the moral education workbook for Vietnamese first graders chooses images as the means to deliver moral discourses.

This paper begins with a literature review of the research on harmony, moral education, gender roles in Vietnam, and gender positioning and representations in textbooks. The conceptual framework section justifies and clarifies the use of the framework for analyzing social actors in visual images by Van Leeuwen (2008). The methodology section provides details on the researched materials and how the images were analyzed. The findings and discussion elaborate on the discourse of harmony and gender-based positioning that are manifested in the textbook illustration. This paper concludes with some reflections on the limitations of the research and potential implications for the field.

Literature Review

The following section focuses on reviewing research that has been done on the Confucian concept of harmony, moral education in Vietnam, gender roles in the Vietnamese society, and gender positioning and representation in textbooks. Despite a strong and growing body of research on each of the above, there is still a lack of research on their interconnectedness. There is little known about the manifestation of the concept of harmony in school textbooks and gender representation in different subjects other than English, history, and children's literature. Furthermore, the analysis of the visual representations of male and female characters in the moral education workbook under the discourses of harmony and gender positioning offers a new way to think about gender and its connection to broader philosophical grounds.

The Confucian Concept of Harmony

As mentioned elsewhere in this paper, the concept of harmony is likely the most influential and well-known in Confucius' teachings and the research on Confucianism. Research on the Confucians has focused on interpreting the meanings of harmony and its manifestations in family life, business management in Asian countries, and social harmony as an overarching goal for society management in East Asia, especially in China (Kim & Park, 2003; Li, 2006, 2013; Wang, 2010; Weatherley, 2002; Yao, 2000; Yun, 2013; Zhang et al., 2005; Zhou, 2008). Most research has underscored significant influences of harmony in intimate relationships such as husband and wife, interpersonal and hierarchical relationships such as staff and manager, and the societal workings that prioritize non-confrontational resolutions. However, certain researchers such as Leung et al. (2002) challenge the dualistic harmony model that associates harmony with cultural collectivism and conflict avoidance. Instead, they argue that Confucian harmony embraces

disagreement and open debates. The concept of harmony continues to be analyzed and understood from different perspectives with renewed and critical interpretations.

Besides the emphasis on explicit relationship, the Confucian concept of harmony also embraces the *yin–yang* philosophy, a cosmic hierarchy in which the two elements mutually complement each other to maintain universal harmony. In ancient Confucian texts such as *Analects* and the *Mencius*, the yin element is not explicitly assigned for the females and the yang for males (Wang, 2005), and the yin–yang binary is not a gender-specific concept (Rosenlee, 2012). Instead, the yin–yang symbolizes the mutual existence of two dynamics, which are oppositional and complement each other. Essentially, Confucianism emphasizes the co-existence and balance of yin–yang elements to sustain a harmonious life.

Despite a substantial body of research on the Confucian ideal of harmony, current research has failed to pay attention to how it unfolds in friendship, an under-researched topic in textbook analysis, or how the harmony concept is reflected in the school curriculum. In researching dyads or more specifically, friendships, most research has been done in the psychological and child development field (Kim, 2010; Rothbaum et al., 2000; Underwood & Buhrmester, 2007; Youngblade et al., 1993). However, such research does not refer to harmony as a Confucian concept or use it as a theoretical framework to explain their findings. With respect to curriculum, research has limited Confucianism as an umbrella term or cultural heritage which presumably should influence or has already penetrated the school curriculum ideologies (Leung et al., 2012; Ngo et al., 2015; Zhang, 2008) yet without a detailed analysis of how it is represented in particular curriculum materials. For instance, Ngo et al. (2015) explore how the Confucian ideology and social constructivism reconcile in primary science education in Vietnam. Leung et al. (2012) and Zhang (2008) discuss the influence of Confucianism in civic education and the potentials of a curriculum towards a Confucian vision in Hong Kong and China respectively. The review of research on the concept of harmony in relationship with friendship and school curriculum suggests that the further exploration of how the representation of harmony, gender roles, and friendship intersect in the curriculum will enrich the understanding of Confucian influences in social relationships and educational contents.

Moral Education in Vietnam

The teaching of morality at Vietnamese primary schools emphasizes individual responsibilities in maintaining hierarchy, social harmony through appropriate behaviors, especially in five relationships including children to parents, wives to husbands, subordinate to master, students to teachers, and siblings to siblings (Burr, 2014; Phan et al., 2011). The principle of teaching about morality is best reflected in the perception of children's minds. Vietnamese people tend to believe that children are like a white piece of paper whose minds need to be written with good moral lessons (Rydström, 2001). These beliefs about the roles of moral education have significantly influenced the teaching methodology for the morality subject at school. Teachers are seen as adults with more understanding of morality and must represent themselves as moral models. Students, being passive moral lesson receivers, have little or no room to reflect on the content being taught to them critically. In other words, the teaching of morality for primary school students reinforces traditional values and fortifies the emphasis for social harmony through good manners and ethics.

Recent research on the characteristics of moral education in Vietnam has also shown that socialist citizenship is also a significant component of the curriculum (Duong & Phan, 2020;

Morgan, 2005; Nguyen & Mitchell, 2014). Doan (2005) argues that the overstretching of socialist ideologies in the moral education curriculum has resulted in conflicting discourses between what is being taught at school and the youth's real life. In other words, the teaching of socialist ideas at school is contradictory with the contemporary way of life in which people increasingly embrace individualism and capitalism. While moral teaching at school encourages "commitment of individuals' to the success to socialism" (Doan, 2005, p. 461), personal success, especially in terms of wealth, is the measurement of life achievement for young people by the contemporary society. Despite the emerging conflicting discourses, the socialist ideals of collective efforts and progress continue to be pervasive in the curriculum.

Scholars have agreed on the premise that textbooks convey and shape ideological ideas, values, and beliefs, and that critically examining the texts and images provides insights on what and how the ideologies and ways of thinking are constructed (Apple, 1992; Luke, 1995; Pinar et al., 1995). While there has been some research on moral education in Vietnam regarding the ideals of the program and different ideological underpinnings (Doan, 2005; Ngo, 2019; Pham & Bui, 2018; Phan et al., 2011), there has not been limited research that critically reviews how the ideological and philosophical ideas are embedded the school materials. In their chapter, Duong & Phan (2020) demonstrate an attempt to take a closer look at the ideologies of the moral education curriculum, but their investigation is limited to the curriculum framework without referring to specific materials. More research on moral education curriculum and textbook contents shall enrich the understanding of how different ideologies and values play out in curricular materials.

Gender Roles in Vietnam

The scholarship on gender roles in contemporary Vietnam has highlighted the influences of both Confucianism and socialist orientation on the perceptions of men and women (Gammeltoft, 2012; Gates et al. 2014; Santillán et al., 2002). The Confucian views on genders dictate that women's position is in the house or private sphere, while men are expected to be in public. While this belief persists in many parts of the country and in public discourses such as commercial advertisements (Hy, 1989; Knodel et al., 2005; Nguyen, 2016), the socialist framework suggests new responsibilities for women which move beyond the household boundaries. Research on the construction of gender shows that the expectations for women in Vietnam have been of high standards (Leshkovich, 2006; Schuler et al., 2006), especially in the post-socialist era. Vietnamese women are expected to "Giỏi việc nước, đảm việc nhà" [being good at the nation's work and managing the housework well]. Meanwhile, masculinity and being the breadwinner are the two major criteria for a real Vietnamese man.

While recent research has underscored that gender inequality remains a problematic issue in Vietnamese society (Ha, 2008; Nguyen, 2016; Santillán et al., 2002), there is still a lack of research that investigates the conjunction between traditional moral values and gender positioning in the school contexts. Women are portrayed in inferior roles in the public domain such as in commercial advertisements or perceived in a lower position in the hierarchical relations in the family. For instance, Ha (2008) argues that Vietnamese women are silenced and voluntarily silence themselves to keep family's harmony. Santillán et al. (2002) 's research suggests the concept of *limited equality* in which Vietnamese women are entitled to more roles outside the house, such as working women. However, such entitlement does not necessarily mean empowerment or equal social recognition in the workplace. Obviously, there have been

some changes in the way gender roles and gender positioning are perceived in society, yet gender discrimination continues to persist. Further exploration on how these issues are communicated with young children via school textbooks opens a venue for a better understanding of how it is shaped and how to reshape it.

Gender Positioning and Visual Presentations of Gender in textbooks

There has been a wealth of research on gender positioning and representations in textbooks and curriculum worldwide. Such research has primarily focused on three dimensions: the inclusion of gender characters, gender positioning, and gender stereotypes (Chrisholm, 2018; Durrani, 2008). Examinations on the presence of women's images in textbooks in most countries highlights the marginalization of women and women's achievement (Blumberg, 2007, 2008; Jones et al., 1997; Law & Chan, 2004; Schocker & Woyshner, 2013; Sleeter & Grant, 2011; Woyshner & Schocker, 2015). The generic description and illustration tend to represent women with more affection and a nurturing nature, such as being a nurse, taking care of children in the house, or being a teacher. Women are also more likely to appear in the private sphere, while men are present in the public sphere (Deckman et al., 2018; Gouvias & Alexopoulos, 2018; Lee & Collins, 2008). In their research about gender stereotyping and under-representation of girls and women in award-winning and popular books, Hamilton et al. (2006) conclude that modern children's books continue to portray sexist images of female characters and occupational stereotypes. Such a growing body of studies on gender positioning and representation in curricular materials has confirmed persistent discriminatory patterns in depicting genders.

However, the existing body of textbook research has two pertaining limitations: the kinds of researched textbooks and sustaining the progress in curriculum improvements. Gender representations in textbooks has been researched in limited subject areas, such as in language textbooks (Barton & Sakwa, 2012; Jones et al. 1997; Lee & Collins, 2009; Yang, 2016), history textbooks (Clark et al., 2005; Commeyras, 1996; Osler, 1994; Schocker & Woyshner, 2013), and children's literature books (Gooden & Gooden, 2001; Grauerholz & Pescosolido, 1989; Marshall, 2004). There is still an array of other school subjects, which are under-researched, including moral education textbooks in countries where moral education exists. Besides, measuring the impacts or changes inspired by the textbook research has been minimal. For example, Clark et al. (2005) and Woyshner & Schocker (2015) agree that women are shown in a broader range of roles, yet such improvement is fragmented and lacks a strong grounded movement for structural changes. These peripheral signs of progress suggest that the work towards gender equality in education has generated certain impacts. That said, this work needs to expand its breadth to different subjects and its depth in reshaping the discourses of gender in curricular materials.

Conceptual Framework

Van Leeuwen (2008) 's social actor framework for analyzing social actors in visual representations reveals the connotations and discourses, including the messages about gender roles in friendships and the discourse of harmony cloaked under visual images. The social actor framework in visual analysis aims at answering two co-present questions "How are the people in the picture represented?" and "How is the viewer's relation to the people in the picture represented?" (Van Leeuwen, 2008, pp. 141-142) The analysis of roles and power dynamics in the images and the relation with viewers reveals each social actors' positioning and potentially

their representation in larger society. Individuals' roles and expected agency are critical in the concept of harmony which places strong emphasis on personal responsibility in maintaining social balance.

With respect to the first research question regarding the frequency of gender portrait, the social actor framework offers an explanation for the inclusion and exclusion of a social group by examining how frequently they are portrayed in images. How often a group or individuals are illustrated in images directly refers to whether the existence of the group is acknowledged or not (Van Leeuwen, 2008). Apple & Christian-Smith (2017) share the same argument that the representation of different groups in textbooks matters. The frequency and space dedicated to specific groups gestures towards their assumed significance. To put it simply, the extent to which a social group of people is represented provides an indicator for interpreting the perception about that group's status in society.

The second dimension in Van Leeuwen's framework (2008) focuses on social actors' roles in the illustrations which often signify the roles in the broader social contexts. Depending on whether actors are involved in an action or not, the actors can play the role of "either agents – the doer of the action, or patients - the person to whom the action is done" (p.142). However, having the agency in a conversation does not guarantee the equal distribution of power among participants. Fairclough (2001) suggests that the choice of words "depends on and helps create social relationships between participants" (p.116), and words themselves carry different expressive values. In visual images, particular ways of depicting actions or agency, agents, and patients also signify the power distribution among actors. Social actors' roles in visual representation can be understood through social relationships between participants and the depicted action's expressive values. This lens of analysis offers insights into how differently boys and girls are presented in the pictures and helps to explain how the different ways of depicting actions carries implicit messages about gender roles and expectations.

Van Leeuwen (2008) posits that the depiction of people in groups diminishes individual distinction and, at the same time, indicates that "they are all the same" (p.114). The portrayal of people in individuals or groups with specific or generic features indicates the assumptions or stereotypes about them. The illustration of generic or specific features of actors serves to underscore their uniqueness or the sameness. For example, in certain images, individuals are portrayed with direct eye contact and at the same eye level with the viewers who are looking at the images. In that case, it indicates that the suggested power between the depicted actor and the viewers are equal. In other cases, if the illustrated actors do not face the viewers or they are depicted as a group, it points to their sameness and insignificance.

Images also carry certain types of social sorting, which subsequently reinforce the stereotypes, often about gender, ethnicity, and race. There are two categorization types in the social actor framework: cultural categorization and biological categorization (Van Leeuwen, 2008). The cultural categorization is expressed through the illustration of appearance and costumes. The biological classification emphasizes and exaggerates the biological traits of a group of people. It should be noted that the two categorizations can imply either negative or positive sociocultural values. For example, in the analysis of Hong Kong's primary English textbook, Yang (2016) finds out that women are often portrayed as having longer hair and wearing dresses more often than pants. This dimension implies the cultural and biological elements presented in the images.

Methodology

The fourth lesson titled "You and friends" in the first-grade moral education workbook is selected as a unit of analysis for this research (Luu et al., 2011, pp.31-32). On the one hand, unit four is representative of the moral education curriculum in terms of emphasizing moral teachings via visual images. First, as a compulsory part of the moral education curriculum for public elementary students, this lesson offers a vignette on a particular way that different discourses, values, and beliefs are infused into the curriculum. The moral lessons about how to behave with peers and assumptions of different roles in the relationship are conveyed through the way characters are illustrated. Second, while images are often seen as decorative or supplemental in older grades, the illustrations in this unit are the core content of the lesson for first graders. The lesson consists mainly of images and one line of task instruction which can be read by teachers or students. Lastly, since this lesson focuses on depicting friendship, the discourse of harmony imbued in these images is understood exclusively in the light of friend to friend relationships.

This lesson consists of four tasks, eleven images, and one or two simple instruction sentences for each task. In the first task, students are required to look at a picture of children giving flowers and play the game giving flowers. The next task presents a set of four images and asks learners to describe what the children in the pictures are doing. The third exercise shows a collection of six photographs and asks learners to make judgments on the appropriateness of the depicted actions. The last activity requires learners to draw a picture of their friend(s). All the instructions in this lesson are written in one or two simple sentences and gives straightforward guidance on what children should do with the images.

This research attends to the eleven illustrated images which revolve around the friendship theme. The researcher first counted the occurrences of images that depicted boys and girls. The frequency of depiction gestures to different levels of inclusion or exclusion of social actors (Van Leeuwen, 2008). Following that, the researcher analyzed the specific ways that social actors are depicted including the roles, the types of illustration, and the connoted cultural biological classifications. This layer of analysis unearths the implicit messages that are imbued in the pictures. Lastly, the researcher examines the analytical findings from a Confucian harmony perspective and identifies its presence and influence in the illustrated images.

Findings and Discussion

The Ideal of Yin-Yang Balance and Gender Binary

Numerically, the inclusion or exclusion of a group or specific gender can be seen from the frequency of each group's appearance in pictures. In this study, the tallies for the number of male and female representations in the lesson show an equal ratio of 1:1. There are 23 occurrences that male and female characters are depicted in the pictures. The equal frequency of depiction of both genders confirms a numerical balance in the inclusion of male and female characters in this lesson. This equal portion is different from other research on gender representations in textbooks, which consistently reports a significantly higher proportion of images of males than those of females (Blumberg, 2008; Clark et al., 2005; Islam & Asadullah, 2018; Jannati, 2015; Osler, 1994; Yang, 2011).

While the findings of the numerically equal representation of both genders seem to be inconsistent with findings from other research on gender-based discrimination, the Confucian perspective of harmony can justify this finding. The yin–yang balance concept helps explain the equal representation of male and female characters in the Vietnamese primary moral education

workbook. The binary male-female is a pragmatic rendering of the yin–yang relation. Women and men represent two cosmic forces, which are inter-connected and assigned with specific roles (Chan, 2000). The inter-connectedness suggests that a balance between the two genders is essential to maintain harmony. Confucianism believes that harmony comes from a thoughtful and equal distribution of opposing elements and of all elements in the universe. As the Vietnamese moral education curriculum, especially at the primary level, is structurally and ideologically influenced by Confucianism, the balanced representation of both genders reflects such influence.

Gender Agency and Gender Assigned Roles

Despite an equal number of boys' and girls' appearances in images, the depiction of social actors reveals the imbalance in agency distribution. In analyzing images, Van Leeuwen (2008) refers to agency as the power to carry active actions, which is opposite to the passiveness of patients who are mostly in the positions of either being inactive or responding to others' actions. Overall, there are more depictions of male characters having agency. Females are more often illustrated in passive roles that respond to the actions initiated by males. For example, in the image of two characters reading together, the boy holds the book while the girl is sitting still in a listening posture. In the interactions between two people of the same gender, girls demonstrate gentle and friendly behaviors like playing jumping ropes together. Interaction among boys is portrayed in either aggressive or undesirable states, such as fighting against each other. The representations of the male and female genders implicate the power of agency and behavioral expectations in relationships.

The characterization of males with more agency than females is often understood in the light of gender discrimination. Research has affirmed gender-biased prevalence in school textbooks (Blumberg, 2008; Lee, 2018; Osler, 1994; Parker et al., 2017; Woyshner & Schocker, 2015; Yang, 2016). Women are more likely to play supportive roles such as helping others instead of initiating actions or conducting indoor activities (Baldwin & Baldwin, 1992; Behnke, 2018; Hamilton et al., 2006; Jabeen et al., 2014). This generic and stereotyped portrayal of genders is the product of gender bias and discrimination, which run deep in many societies worldwide.

The imbalance of power distribution between male and female characters can also be analyzed under the framework of Confucian harmony. In essence, the moral education workbook illustrations echo the long-rooted Confucian traditions in the Vietnamese culture. The principles that configure social harmony underscore individuals' acknowledgment and compliance to Confucius's teachings. Accordingly, women and men must fulfill their responsibilities to comply with the universal operational philosophy taught in Confucian writings. For women, those responsibilities include supporting men and accepting the hierarchical relationship in which their stance is inferior (Yun, 2013). Notoriously, such requirements of harmony often directly connote sexism and gender oppression (Baldwin & Baldwin, 1992; Gouvias & Alexopoulos, 2018; Hamilton et al., 2006). The portrayal of female characters in this Vietnamese moral education lesson perfectly resonates with the ideas of women's positions and obligations to cultivate social harmony.

Men and women living in a Confucianism-influenced society are also expected to demonstrate particular traits to be considered a moral person. The visual images in the moral education workbook implicitly define the righteous behaviors for young children. For example, in the relationship between two boys, the boys demonstrate their masculinity through the act of

fighting and hitting each other. Meanwhile, the relationship between the two girls exhibits cooperation and compassion. Such depictions of women's traits align with the expected Confucian feminine virtues "desirable from the male point of view, such as quietness, obedience, good manners" (Gao, 2003, p.115). These characteristics are still the criteria for what it means to be women in modern-day Vietnam (Grosse, 2015; Schuler et al., 2006). The visualization of advised behaviors for boys and girls in a friendship signifies one of the ways to attain harmony – through compromises and humility. Furthermore, it is often women who are expected to accept compromises and show their humility. This places a burden on women impeding the process of empowering women and achieving gender equity in Vietnamese society.

Cultural Categorization and The Rigidity of Harmony

The explicit depiction of the characters' appearance, such as clothes and hairstyles, carries implicit cultural categorization or in other words, the assumed cultural norms for each social group. Van Leeuwen (2008) suggests that the selection of cultural elements in the visual images might indicate social groups' homogenization. In this workbook lesson, most girls are wearing skirts and tied hair or ponytails. Boys have short hair and are wearing either short or long pants. When girls are wearing pants, their faces are hidden or not highly visible. The physical appearances of males and females are homogenized.

The unified and consistent way of depicting genders in this lesson has several ramifications. First, the homogenic visualization of each gender reinforces the gender stereotypes, with respect to the right way of being boys and being girls. Across these images, girls should wear certain hairstyles and clothes if they are showing their face in the picture. If girls wear pants, they are not directly visible to viewers. In other words, the unwanted way of being is not appreciated and not to be displayed clearly. Secondly, the homogeneity of illustrating genders also suggests a notion of uniformity and conformity. The socialist discourse legitimates uniformity and conformity as the requisite to attain social stability (Doan, 2005; Duong & Phan, 2020). Such ideology is reflected in multiple layers of the education system, such as in the centralized management method, a set of textbooks for public students, and in the content of a single lesson as in this example. Overall, the representation of gender in this lesson connotes the rigidity of the views toward genders and the social expectations for each gender.

This rigid perspective on both genders' expressions is a profound indicator of the influences of the Confucian concept of harmony. While Confucianism embraces the fluidity and reciprocity in formulating harmonious relationships, the philosophy also emphasizes imposing its sets of rules and conformity in implementing them (Li, 2006). In the friendship lesson, first graders are introduced to a set of rules to play their gender roles in appropriate ways. The rules are prescriptions for how to act and dress like a girl or a boy. The tacit understanding is that with conformity to prescribed tasks, each person is doing their part to ensure harmony in the society. Furthermore, as these images are situated in the moral education workbook, harmony acts as an overarching goal and a reason to justify the rigidity in defining a moral person. The stark contradictions between the aspiration for a harmonious society and the reinforcement of compliance with unbending rules of harmony are condensed in this lesson about friendship.

Conclusions

This paper has explored the gender visual representations in a moral lesson by using the social actor relationship framework and explaining the analysis results in the light of the Confucian concept of harmony. In terms of the inclusion and exclusion of social groups, this research finds an equal number of male and female characters portrayed in the lesson. While this result sounds unrealistic, especially in consideration of the continuity of gender discrimination in Vietnam and other parts of the world, it can be explained by the yin–yang balance concept. The yin–yang philosophy prioritizes an equal distribution of oppositional elements to maintain harmony.

Expected gender roles, agency, and implicit cultural categorization is analyzed by the social actor framework and then situated in relation to the harmony concept. The prescribed roles attribute male characters with more activeness and power while attaching more passive and compromising traits to female characters. The bias in ascribing more powerful roles to male characters can be understood from a gender-biased view and from a harmony attainment perspective. This study has highlighted the rigid ways in which harmony is presented in the workbook's images. The moral textbook implicitly prescribes roles for boys and girls and conveys the message of conformity and compliance. Being aware of one's roles and complying with the rules are stepping-stones to becoming a moral person. As a result, moral people can achieve harmony in relationships including friendship.

There are some limitations of this research that may affect its results. Firstly, while this single lesson can offer a focused view on friendship, it is not an exhaustive representation of the curriculum. In order to make a broader claim on the influence of the concept of harmony in the entire curriculum, further research can investigate a broader range of units in this workbook and potentially a complete collection of moral education workbooks and textbooks for Vietnamese primary school students. Secondly, this study looks exclusively at images, which is highly focused, yet potentially loses sight of the texts' discourses. In this lesson, most texts only include short and simple task instructions as they are written for first graders. In larger scales, research can look at both texts and images in the textbook to enrich the data and draw a more comprehensive conclusion on the discourses that are embedded in textbooks. Lastly, this research has only covered how gender representation and the discourse of harmony are interweaved in friendship. More research can delve into how other important issues such as ethnicity and class are introduced and presented in the curriculum. A longer list of relationships such as husband-wife, student-teacher, and parent-child will yield richer understandings of how harmony manifests in inter-personal relationships.

In conclusion, despite the limited scope of the analysis, this research has several implications. The investigation of how the discourses of harmony and gender roles are constructed through visual images provides significant understandings of the kind of morality that is taught. This research offers new insights and perspectives for Vietnamese educators who are working on renovating the curriculum, especially in their effort to transform the moral education curriculum towards being more critical and inclusive (Ngo, 2019; Pham & Bui, 2018). In a broader context, the research contributes to enriching the current scholarship on moral education and the influences of historical and cultural heritage on the contemporary curriculum. This research approach, which attends to analyzing a specific curriculum, challenges the tradition in researching Confucianism that often claims the Confucian influences in education but provides insufficient practical evidence such as in curricular materials. Finally, this study adds to the list of researched subjects and opens another pathway for textbook research.

Author Notes

Thi Nhu Quynh Dang is a Ph.D. student at the Department of Curriculum and Instruction, Indiana University Bloomington. She is interested in social studies education, civic education and moral education. Her research has been focusing on analyzing visual representation in social studies curriculum and student understanding of social issues via images.

References

- Apple, M., & Christian-Smith, L. (2017). *The politics of the textbook*. Routledge.
- Apple, M. W. (1992). The text and cultural politics. *Educational Researcher*, 21(7), 4-19. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189x021007004>
- Baldwin, P., & Baldwin, D. (1992). The portrayal of women in classroom textbooks. *Canadian Social Studies*, 26(3), 110-114. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ456501>
- Barton, A., & Sakwa, L. N. (2012). The representation of gender in English textbooks in Uganda. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 20(2), 173-190. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2012.669394>
- Behnke, Y. (2018). Textbook effects and efficacy. In *The Palgrave handbook of textbook studies* (pp. 383-398). Springer.
- Blumberg, R. L. (2007). *Gender bias in textbooks: A hidden obstacle on the road to gender equality in education*. Unesco Paris.
- Blumberg, R. L. (2008). The invisible obstacle to educational equality: Gender bias in textbooks. *Prospects*, 38(3), 345-361. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-009-9086-1>
- Burr, R. (2014). The complexity of morality: Being a 'good child' in Vietnam? *Journal of Moral Education*, 43(2), 156-168. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2014.893421>
- Chan, S. Y. (2000). Gender and relationship roles in the Analects and the Mencius. *Asian Philosophy*, 10(2), 115-132. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09552360050121119>
- Chisholm L. (2018) Representations of Class, Race, and Gender in Textbooks. In: Fuchs E., Bock A. (eds) *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*. Palgrave Macmillan, New York. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-53142-1_16
- Clark, R., Ayton, K., Frechette, N., & Keller, P. J. (2005). Women of the world, re-write! Women in American world history high school textbooks from the 1960s, 1980s, and 1990s. *Social Education*, 69(1), 41-46. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ710267>
- Commeyras, M. (1996). Reading about women in world history textbooks from one feminist perspective. *Gender and Education*, 8(1), 31-48. <https://doi.org/10.1080/713668481>
- Deckman, S. L., Fulmer, E. F., Kirby, K., Hoover, K., & Mackall, A. S. (2018). Numbers are just not enough: a critical analysis of race, gender, and sexuality in elementary and middle school health textbooks. *Educational Studies*, 54(3), 285-302. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131946.2017.1411261>
- Doan, D. H. (2005). Moral education or political education in the Vietnamese educational system? *Journal of Moral Education*, 34(4), 451-463. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240500414733>
- Duong, H. B., & Phan, L.-H. (2020). Socialist citizenship in the post-socialist era across time and space: A closer look at Cuba and Vietnam. *The Palgrave Handbook of Citizenship and Education*, 619-632.
- Durrani, N. (2008). Schooling the 'other': The representation of gender and national identities in Pakistani curriculum texts. *Compare*, 38(5), 595-610.
- Fairclough, N. (2001). *Language and power*. Pearson Education.

- Gammeltoft, T. (2012). *Women's bodies, women's worries: Health and family planning in a Vietnamese rural commune*. Routledge.
- Gao, X. (2003). Women existing for men: Confucianism and social injustice against women in China. *Race, Gender & Class*, 114-125. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41675091>
- Gates, C., Noerlund, I., & Vu, V. C. D. (2014). *Vietnam in a changing world*. Routledge.
- Gooden, A. M., & Gooden, M. A. (2001). Gender representation in notable children's literature picture books. *Sex Roles*, 45, 89-101. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1013064418674>
- Gouviás, D., & Alexopoulos, C. (2018). Sexist stereotypes in the language textbooks of the Greek primary school: a multidimensional approach. *Gender and Education*, 30(5), 642-662. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540253.2016.1237620>
- Grauerholz, E., & Pescosolido, B. A. (1989). Gender representation in children's literature: 1900-1984. *Gender & Society*, 3(1), 113-125. <https://doi.org/10.1177/089124389003001008>
- Grosse, I. (2015). Gender values in Vietnam—Between Confucianism, communism, and modernization. *Asian Journal of Peacebuilding*, 3(2), pp. 252-272. <http://hdl.handle.net/10371/94819>
- Ha, V. S. (2008). The harmony of family and the silence of women: Sexual attitudes and practices among rural married women in northern Viet Nam. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 10(S1), S163-S176. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691050701805501>
- Hamilton, M. C., Anderson, D., Broadus, M., & Young, K. (2006). Gender stereotyping and under-representation of female characters in 200 popular children's picture books: A twenty-first century update. *Sex Roles*, 55(11-12), 757-765. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-006-9128-6>
- Hy, V. L. (1989). Vietnamese kinship: structural principles and the socialist transformation in northern Vietnam. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 741-756. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2058112>
- Islam, K. M. M., & Asadullah, M. N. (2018). Gender stereotypes and education: A comparative content analysis of Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani, and Bangladeshi school textbooks. *PloS one*, 13(1). <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0190807>
- Jabeen, S., Chaudhary, A. Q., & Omar, S. (2014). Gender discrimination in curriculum: A reflection from Punjab textbook board. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 36(1), 55-77. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1210444>
- Jannati, S. (2015). Gender representation in EFL textbooks: A case of ILI pre-intermediate series. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, 2(3), 211-222. <https://www.jallr.com/index.php/JALLR/article/view/54>
- Jones, M. A., Kiteu, C., & Sunderland, J. (1997). Discourse roles, gender, and language textbook dialogues: Who learns what from John and Sally? *Gender and Education*, 9(4), 469-490. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540259721204>
- Kim, A. E., & Park, G.-s. (2003). Nationalism, Confucianism, work ethic, and industrialization in South Korea. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 33(1), 37-49. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00472330380000041>
- Kim, M. (2010). *Conflict and harmony during interaction of preschool children: Influences of relationship status of dyads*. [Doctoral dissertation, Auburn University]. <http://hdl.handle.net/10415/2301>

- Knodel, J., Loi, V. M., Jayakody, R., & Huy, V. T. (2005). Gender roles in the family: Change and stability in Vietnam. *Asian Population Studies*, 1(1), 69-92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441730500125888>
- Law, K. W. K., & Chan, A. H. (2004). Gender role stereotyping in Hong Kong's primary school Chinese language subject textbooks. *Asian Journal of Women's Studies*, 10(1), 49-69. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12259276.2004.11665965>
- Lee, J. F., & Collins, P. (2008). Gender voices in Hong Kong English textbooks—Some past and current practices. *Sex Roles*, 59(1-2), 127-137. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-008-9414-6>
- Lee, J. F., & Collins, P. (2009). Australian English-language textbooks: the gender issues. *Gender and Education*, 21(4), 353-370. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540250802392257>
- Lee, J. F. K. (2018). Gender representation in Japanese EFL textbooks – a corpus study. *Gender and Education*, 30(3), 379-395. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540253.2016.1214690>
- Leshkovich, A. M. (2006). Woman, Buddhist, entrepreneur: Gender, moral values, and class anxiety in late socialist Vietnam. *Journal of Vietnamese Studies* 1(1-2), 277-313. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1525/vs.2006.1.1-2.277>
- Leung, K., Koch, P. T., & Lu, L. (2002). A dualistic model of harmony and its implications for Conflict Management in Asia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 19(2), 201-220. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1016287501806>
- Leung, Y. W., & Yuen, T. W. W. (2012). Competition between politicized and depoliticized versions of civic education curricula: The case of Hong Kong. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 11(1), 45-56. <https://doi.org/10.2304/csee.2012.11.1.45>
- Li, C. (2006). The Confucian ideal of harmony. *Philosophy East and West*, 583-603. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4488054>
- Li, C. (2008). The philosophy of harmony in classical Confucianism. *Philosophy Compass*, 3(3), 423-435. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-9991.2008.00141.x>
- Li, C. (2013). *The Confucian philosophy of harmony* (Vol. 10). Routledge.
- Luke, A. (1995). Text and discourse in education: An introduction to critical discourse analysis. *Review of Research in Education*, 21(1), 3-48. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732x021001003>
- Luu, T.T; Nguyen, T.V.H; Le. T.T.M; Tran, T.T.O; Mac, V. T. (2011). *Grade one moral education workbook*. Vietnam Education Publishing House.
- Marshall, E. (2004). Stripping for the wolf: Rethinking representations of gender in children's literature. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 39(3), 256-270. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1598/RRQ.39.3.1>
- Morgan, J. M. (2005). Marxism and moral education. *Journal of Moral Education*, 34(4), 391-398. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240500410079>
- Ministry of Education and Training, Vietnam. (2017). The moral education subject. <http://rgep.moet.gov.vn/content/tintuc/Lists/news/Attachments/4542/d%20-%20M%C3%B4n%20C4%90%E1%BA%A1o%20C4%90%E1%BB%A9c.pdf>
- Ngo, V. T. H. (2019). The implementation of critical thinking in Vietnamese primary school moral education classes. *Issues in Educational Research*, 29(3), 732-755. <http://www.iier.org.au/iier29/hang.pdf>
- Ngo, V. T. H., Meijer, M. R., Bulte, A. M. W., & Pilot, A. (2015). The implementation of a social constructivist approach in primary science education in Confucian heritage culture:

- the case of Vietnam. *Cultural Studies of Science Education*, 10(3), 665-693.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11422-014-9634-8>
- Nguyen, H. L. (2016). Vietnamese women's representation in TV commercials related to Lunar New Year: A critical discourse analysis. *VNU Journal of Foreign Studies*, 32(2).
<https://js.vnu.edu.vn/FS/article/view/1539>
- Nguyen, X.-T., & Mitchell, C. (2014). Inclusion in Vietnam: An intersectionality perspective on girls with disabilities and education. *Childhood*, 21(3), 324-338.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0907568214524459>
- Osler, A. (1994). Still hidden from history? The representation of women in recently published history textbooks. *Oxford Review of Education*, 20(2), 219-235.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/0305498940200206>
- Parker, R., Larkin, T., & Cockburn, J. (2017). A visual analysis of gender bias in contemporary anatomy textbooks. *Social Science & Medicine*, 180, 106-113.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.03.032>
- Pham, V. T., & Bui, T. N. (2018). Moral education at Vietnamese schools in the present globalization trend. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 6(6), 795-803.
<http://pubs.sciepub.com/education/6/6/31/index.html>
- Phan, L. H., McPherron, P., & Phan, V. Q. (2011). English language teachers as moral guides in Vietnam and China: Maintaining and re-traditionalizing morality. *Education reform in China: Changing concepts, contexts and practices*, 132-157.
- Pinar, W. F. R., William M.; Slattery, Patrick; Taubman, Peter M..(1995). *Understanding curriculum: An introduction to the study of historical and contemporary curriculum discourses* (Vol. 17). Peter Lang.
- Rosenlee, L.-H. L. (2012). *Confucianism and women: A philosophical interpretation*. SUNY Press.
- Rothbaum, F., Pott, M., Azuma, H., Miyake, K., & Weisz, J. (2000). The development of close relationships in Japan and the United States: Paths of symbiotic harmony and generative tension. *Child Development*, 71(5), 1121-1142. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8624.00214>
- Rydström, H. (2001). 'Like a white piece of paper'. Embodiment and the moral upbringing of Vietnamese children. *Ethnos*, 66(3), 394-413.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00141840120095159>
- Santillán, D., Schuler, S., Anh, H. T., Minh, T. H., & Mai, B. T. T. (2002). Limited equality: contradictory ideas about gender and the implications for reproductive health in rural Vietnam. *Journal of Health Management*, 4(2), 251-267.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/097206340200400210>
- Schocker, J. B., & Woyshner, C. (2013). Representing African American women in US history textbooks. *The Social Studies*, 104(1), 23-31.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00377996.2012.655346>
- Schuler, S. R., Anh, H. T., Ha, V. S., Minh, T. H., Mai, B. T. T., & Thien, P. V. (2006). Constructions of gender in Vietnam: In pursuit of the 'Three Criteria'. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 8(5), 383-394. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691050600858924>
- Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (2011). Race, class, gender, and disability in current textbooks. *The textbook as discourse. Sociocultural dimensions of American schoolbooks*, 183-215.
- Truong, T. D., Hallinger, P., & Sanga, K. (2017). Confucian values and school leadership in Vietnam: Exploring the influence of culture on principal decision making. *Educational*

- Management Administration & Leadership*, 45(1), 77-100.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143215607877>
- Tu, W.-M. (1998). Probing the 'three bonds' and 'five relationships' in Confucian humanism. *Confucianism and the family*, 121-136.
- Underwood, M. K., & Buhrmester, D. (2007). Friendship features and social exclusion: An observational study examining gender social context. *Merrill-Palmer Quarterly* (1982), 53(3), 412-438. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23096127>
- Van Leeuwen, T. (2008). *Discourse and practice: New tools for critical discourse analysis*. Oxford University Press.
- Wang, R. R. (2005). Dong Zhongshu's transformation of "Yin-Yang" theory and contesting of gender identity. *Philosophy East and West*, 209-231.
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/4487951>
- Wang, Y.-k. (2010). *Harmony and war: Confucian culture and Chinese power politics*. Columbia University Press.
- Weatherley, R. (2002). Harmony, hierarchy, and duty-based morality: The Confucian antipathy towards rights. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, 12(2), 245-267.
<https://doi.org/10.1075/japc.12.2.04wea>
- Woynshner, C., & Schocker, J. B. (2015). Cultural parallax and content analysis: Images of Black women in high school history textbooks. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, 43(4), 441-468. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2015.1099487>
- Yang, C. C. R. (2011). Gender representation in a Hong Kong primary English textbook series: The relationship between language planning and social policy. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 12(1), 77-88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2011.541390>
- Yang, C. C. R. (2016). Are males and females still portrayed stereotypically? Visual analyses of gender in two Hong Kong primary English Language textbook series. *Gender and Education*, 28(5), 674-692. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540253.2015.1103839>
- Yao, X. (2000). *An introduction to Confucianism*. Cambridge University Press.
<http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/iub-ebooks/detail.action?docID=217851>
- Youngblade, L. M., Park, K. A., & Belsky, J. (1993). Measurement of young children's close friendship: A comparison of two independent assessment systems and their associations with attachment security. *International Journal of Behavioral Development*, 16(4), 563-587. <https://doi.org/10.1177/016502549301600403>
- Yun, S. H. (2013). An analysis of Confucianism's yin-yang harmony with nature and the traditional oppression of women: Implications for social work practice. *Journal of Social Work*, 13(6), 582-598. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468017312436445>
- Zhang, H. (2008). Toward a Confucian vision of curriculum In C. W. Eppert, Hongyu (Ed.), *Cross-cultural studies in curriculum: Eastern thought, educational insights* (335-348). Routledge.
- Zhang, Y. B., Lin, M.-C., Nonaka, A., & Beom, K. (2005). Harmony, hierarchy, and conservatism: A cross-cultural comparison of Confucian values in China, Korea, Japan, and Taiwan. *Communication research reports*, 22(2), 107-115.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00036810500130539>
- Zhou, Y. (2008). The modern significance of Confucianism. *Asian Social Science*, 4(11), 13-16.
<http://ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ass/article/view/782/756>